STUDIES IN EARLY MODERN RELIGIOUS REFORMS

Divinity Compromised

A Study of Divine Accommodation in the Thought of John Calvin

Jon Balserak



STUDIES IN EARLY MODERN RELIGIOUS REFORMS

Divinity Compromised

A Study of Divine Accommodation in the Thought of John Calvin

Jon Balserak



DIVINITY COMPROMISED

DIVINITY COMPROMISED A STUDY OF DIVINE ACCOMMODATION IN THE THOUGHT OF JOHN CALVIN

by JON BALSERAK



STUDIES IN EARLY MODERN RELIGIOUS REFORMS

VOLUME 5

Editor Irena Backus, University of Geneva

Board of Consulting Editors Michael J.B. Allen, University of California at Los Angeles Guy Bedouelle, Université de Fribourg Emidio Campi, University of Zürich Bernard Cottret, Université de Paris-Versailles Denis Crouzet, Université de Paris IV-Sorbonne Luc Deitz, Bibliothèque nationale de Luxembourg Paul Grendler, (Emeritus) University of Toronto Susan C. Karant-Nunn, University of Arizona, Tucson Ralph Keen, University of Iowa Maria-Cristina Pitassi, University of Geneva Herman J. Selderhuis, Theological University Apeldoorn David Steinmetz, Duke University, Durham, NC Christoph Strohm, Ruhr Universität Bochum John L. Thompson, Fuller Theological Seminary, Pasadena Mark Vessey, The University of British Columbia Lee Palmer Wandel, University of Wisconsin-Madison David F. Wright, The University of Edinburgh

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

ISBN-10 1-4020-5055-0 (HB) ISBN-13 978-1-4020-5055-8 (HB) ISBN-10 1-4020-5056-9 (e-book) ISBN-13 978-1-4020-5056-5 (e-book)

> Published by Springer, P.O. Box 17, 3300 AA Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

> > www.springer.com

Printed on acid-free paper

All Rights Reserved © 2006 Springer

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

Printed and bound in the Netherlands.

CONTENTS

Prefaceix	
INTRODUCTION 1 1. Assessing the Progress of Research Since 1952 1 2. The Contents of this Study 10	
 DIVINE ACCOMMODATION IN THE TRADITION AND CALVIN	
on the Motif	
2.1.1 Joel 3: 4-5	
 2.2 Angels: Psalm 91: 11, 12 and Psalm 34: 7	
2.4 OT case laws: Exodus 21: 7-11 29 2.5 Summary 32	

HUMAN CAPTUS	
1. Human Nature in Calvin	35
1.1 Historical Background	
1.2 Calvin Studies and Calvin	
1.3 Sin and the 'totus homo'	38
2. Human Captus in Calvin's Thought in Relation to Accommodation	40
2.1 Assessing Opinion on this Issue	

v

CONTENTS

2	.1.1	Edward Dowey's Contribution	. 40
2	.1.2	E. David Willis' Contribution	. 41
2	.1.3	David Wright's Contribution	. 41
2	.1.4	Summary	
2.2	Hum	an Capacity: A Survey of its Various Senses	. 42
2	.2.1	General References to Human Capacity	. 43
2	.2.2	The Human Condition	. 44
2	.2.3	The Question of Sin and its Relation to Human Capacity	. 46
2	.2.4	Mental Weakness Respecting the Knowledge of God	
		and Spiritual Matters	.47
2	.2.5	Fear, Grief and Doubt	. 49
2	.2.6	Lack of Restraint, Inappropriate Desires and Imperfection	. 50
2	.2.7	Sluggishness, Willfulness, and Hypocrisy	. 51
2	.2.8	Barbarity	. 53
2.3	The	Various Senses Reviewed	. 54
3.	Analyz	zing Calvin's Teaching on Human Captus: the Recipients	
	of Acc	ommodation	. 54
3.1		an Beings as Creatures	
3.2	Hum	an Beings as Sinners	. 55
3.3		l as Primitive Nation	
3.4	Hum	an Beings as Either the Wicked or the Godly	. 56
4.	Conclu	ision	. 57

GOD'S AC	CCOMMODATING RESPONSES TO HUMAN CAPTUS	59
	Accommodating According to Calvin	
	en God Instructs	
1.1.1	God Reveals Himself Through his Works	
1.1.2	God Speaks	60
1.1.3	God Discloses Himself in Christ	64
1.1.4	God's Unaccommodated Revelation to his People in Glory	
1.2 Whe	en God Legislates and Commands	
1.2.1	God's Moral Law	67
1.2.2	God's Old Testament Case Laws	
1.2.3	God's ad hoc Commands Given to Israel	71
1.2.4	God's Rewarding of Obedience	73
1.2.5	The Duration of these Forms of Accommodation	
1.3 Whe	en God Sanctions Religious Rites and Practices, and Receives	
the	Worship of his People	76
1.3.1	God's Accommodating of the Practices Sanctioned in Worship	76
1.3.2	God's Accommodating of the Reception of Worship	81
1.3.3	The End of Accommodated Worship	83
1.4 Whe	en God Pastors his Flock	83
1.4.1	God Cares for, Leads, and Protects his People	84
1.4.2	God Employs Angels	
1.4.3	God Rouses, Threatens, Tests, and Chastens	87

vi

1.5 When God Comes to Earth	
1.6 When God Covenants	
2. Conclusion	
2.1 Reviewing the Chapter	
2.2 Assessing Findings up to this Point	

GOD'S REASONS FOR ACCOMMODATING—IMAGES OF GOD

IN C	ALVIN'S HANDLING OF ACCOMMODATION	
1.	An Introduction to Calvin's Statements on God's Reasons	
	for Accommodating	
1.1	Reference to a Motive	
1.2	Reference to a Cause	
1.3	Reference to a Purpose	
1.4	Reference to a Contingency with Which God Must Deal	
2.	Earlier Portraits of Calvin's Accommodating God	
3.	Images of Calvin's Accommodating God	
3.1	Transcendent and Incomprehensible; Good and Loving	
3.2	Practical and Productive	
3.3	Expedient, Pragmatic	
3.4	Unprincipled, Desperate	
3.5	Anxious, Obsessive	
3.6	Tender, Tolerant, Enslaved	
4.	Conclusion	

ACCOMMODATION AND CALVIN'S THINKING ON THE POWER

OF GOD		
1. Calvir	and the Potentia Absoluta/Ordinata Distinction	
1.1 A B	rief History of the Distinction	
1.2 Calv	in and the Distinction	141
1.2.1	Calvin and the Absolute Power of God-Traditional	145
1.2.2	Calvin and the Absolute Power of God-Scotistic	146
1.2.3	On the Joining of these Two Viewpoints	149
1.2.4	Summary	150
2. Accor	nmodation and the Potentia Ordinata in Calvin	150
2.1 The	Created Order	151
2.2 The	Order of Salvation	155
2.2.1	Instruments, Angels and Baptism	
2.2.2	The Law	157
2.2.3	God's Providential Care	
2.2.4	Other Loci: The Incarnation and Atonement	
2.2.5	Summary	161
3. Concl	usion	

CONTENTS

ATILITY OF ACCOMMODATION	
ure, Meaning and Truth	
nples of Calvin's Treating of Divine Injunctions	
Deuteronomy 21: 10-13	
Deuteronomy 20: 12-15	
Deuteronomy 20: 16-18	171
Exodus 21: 12, 18	171
Matthew 19: 7-8	171
Deuteronomy 22: 22-27	
Leviticus 18:22-30 and Exodus 22: 19	
Exodus 21: 1-11	
Summarizing Calvin's Practice	
essing Calvin's Treatment of the Law	
Questioning Calvin's Practice	
	ATILITY OF ACCOMMODATION ure, Meaning and Truth nples of Calvin's Treating of Divine Injunctions Deuteronomy 21: 10-13 Deuteronomy 20: 12-15 Deuteronomy 20: 16-18 Exodus 21: 12, 18 Matthew 19: 7-8 Deuteronomy 22: 22-27 Leviticus 18:22-30 and Exodus 22: 19 Exodus 21: 1-11 Summarizing Calvin's Practice essing Calvin's Treatment of the Law Gauging Calvin's Practice Examining Calvin's Practice Examining Calvin's Method

CON	NCLUDING REFLECTIONS	185
1.	Summary	185
2.	Some Thoughts on Accommodation and Calvin's Doctrine of God	187
3.	Future Topics for Research	190

BIBI	LIOGRAPHY	193
1.	Abbreviations	193
2.	Bibliography	193
	Calvin's Works	
2.2	2 Translations of Calvin's Works	194
2.3	Patristic, Medieval and Reformation Works	195
2.4	Secondary Works [selected]	197

INDEX OF CALVIN'S WORKS	
INDEX OF PERSONS	

viii

PREFACE

Divine accommodation in John Calvin's thought has yet to receive the attention it deserves. To date it has not been the subject of a monograph-length treatment in any language (this study is the first) and the number of journal articles and book chapters devoted solely to it is small. The present work will, it is hoped, help to fill this lacuna in research on the topic, but additional research is undoubtedly still needed.

Its title probably deserves a comment. The use of the word *compromised* is intended to raise the question of the extent of accommodation's penetration into Calvin's doctrine of God. It aims to suggest the idea that Calvin's thinking on accommodation might possess qualities which push against traditional thinking on the divine attributes. The idea was first suggested by E. David Willis. The present study will aim to expand upon it.

This monograph owes much to the efforts of Emeritus Professor of Patristic and Reformed Christianity, David F. Wright, who, as supervisor, colleague and friend, has offered assistance to me on innumerable occasions and has also demonstrated a level of scholarly excellence in his own work that has been enormously instructive and encouraging. Thanks are also due to a host of others. Thanks must be expressed to Professor Tony Lane, who offered very helpful criticisms of two earlier versions of this work and whose kindness has not gone unnoticed or unappreciated. Thanks are also due to Buccleuch and Greyfriars Free Church of Scotland, whose love has been a regular source of strength (particularly Alex MacDonald and Bob Akroyd); to the theology department of the University of Birmingham (particularly Professor David Parker and Dr Philip Burton, whose friendship and counsel have been extremely helpful to me); to New Hope, P.C.A. (Fairfax, Virginia, U.S.A.); to my family (to whom I owe a huge debt of gratitude in so many ways); to Dr. J. Ligon Duncan III and Dr. W. Duncan Rankin (both of whom were enormously kind to me during my time in Mississippi), and to Dr Charles R. Vogan Jr. My wife has been the most wonderful friend, encouragement, teacher and companion to me; it is to her that this study is dedicated. If I can achieve in my lifetime what she has already achieved, I will be happy.

ix

PREFACE

This work contains shortcomings which are, unfortunately, all too apparent. Nonetheless it is an honest attempt to grapple with a concept in Calvin which is worth coming to terms with. May it serve the scholarly community of those who study the Reformation and Calvin, Christians and any who have an interest in the Genevan's writings, and ultimately the Church of the Lord Jesus Christ.

> J.B. Edinburgh, Scotland 21 February 2006 (the feast day of Saint Paterius)

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

The present work is a study of divine accommodation in the thought of John Calvin.¹ It aims to analyze the character of Calvin's thought on accommodation, to give an account of the ways in which it expresses itself in his writings, to probe how it penetrates his thought and doctrine of God, and to relate, to some degree, Calvin's treatment of accommodation to that found in his predecessors and contemporaries. Although accommodation expresses itself throughout the reformer's *corpus*—his Old and New Testament commentaries, lectures, sermons, tracts, treatises and, of course, the *Institutes*—the majority of citations found below will come from Calvin's expositions of the Hebrew scriptures, because that is where accommodation is most often discussed by him. As this is not the first study of divine accommodation in Calvin's theology, it seems appropriate that we begin by considering the scholarly work produced on this theme in the reformer up to this point.²

1. ASSESSING THE PROGRESS OF RESEARCH SINCE 1952

In the middle of the twentieth century a fourteen-page treatment of divine accommodation appeared in the introductory portion of Edward Dowey's *The Knowledge of God in Calvin's Theology*. It is extremely unlikely that anyone realized at the time how significant it was. It was arguably the first treatment of this important motif within Calviniana, and the first of several perspectives on Calvin's thinking on accommodation to arise during that century.³ Influenced, it seems likely,

1

¹ For a broader consideration of divine accommodation in Christian thought, see K. Duchatelez, 'La "Condescendance" divine et l'histoire du salut,' *Nouvelle revue théologique* 95 (1973), 593-621; Stephen Benin, *The Footprints of God: Divine Accommodation in Jewish and Christian Thought* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1993).

² The present study is a significantly-revised version of the author's Ph.D. thesis, "Deus humanitus saepe cum suis agere solet:" An Analysis of Divine Accommodation in the Thought of John Calvin' (unpublished thesis, University of Edinburgh, December 2002). This work of revision has sought to sharpen analysis of the topic and expand its coverage with the addition of chapters seven and eight. Revision of the current chapter has resulted in the inclusion of Hedtke's work, which did not feature in the thesis. For penetrating discussion of scholarly literature on accommodation in Calvin, see, David F. Wright, 'Calvin's "Accommodation" Revisited,' in *Calvin as Exegete: Papers and Responses Presented at the Ninth Colloquium on Calvin and Calvin Studies*, ed. Peter De Klerk (Grand Rapids: Calvin Studies Society, 1995), 171-190.

³ Edward Dowey, *The Knowledge of God in Calvin's Theology* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1952), 3-17. Though accommodation is mentioned in the modern period in relation to Calvin as early as 1849 by Thomas Myers (John Calvin, *CTS Ezekiel*, 2, 448-51), Dowey's fourteen-page treatment is the

CHAPTER 1

by nineteenth and twentieth century dogmatics, Dowey presented an interpretation of accommodation which reflected the theological milieu of his day.⁴ Accommodation was, he argued, fundamentally related to the concept of knowledge (which Calvin's theology 'exalts'⁵), and specifically to the *cognitio Dei*. It helped explain how Calvin's incomprehensible God could be known. More to the point, it explained how this God could reveal himself to his crude and mentally-feeble people; namely, by accommodating the knowledge of himself to their capacity. Dowey's definition of the theme brings this out nicely: '[t]he term accommodation refers to the process by which God reduces or adjusts to human capacities what he wills to reveal of the infinite mysteries of his being, which by their very nature are beyond the powers of the mind of man to grasp.'6 In expounding this definition, Dowey added precision to it by carefully differentiating between accommodation to human finitude (what he called 'essential' limitations of human nature) and to human sinfulness ('accidental' limitations).⁷ This division became the structure for his treatment of the concept. Within that treatment, Dowey focused in the first section upon that knowledge of God which is learned from God's works, and in the second upon the knowledge of God the Redeemer; thus reflecting Dowey's indebtedness to the Institutes. With this pioneering treatment, the Princetonian not only introduced his now-classic interpretation of the knowledge of God in Calvin, but also helped the nascent study of accommodation in the reformer to take its first steps.

Before introducing the second perspective, attention should be paid to the 1969 work of Reinhold Hedtke, *Erziehung durch die Kirche bei Calvin*,⁸ which in some ways adumbrated it. Hedtke addressed accommodation in two sections, one on pedagogy (33-39) and the other preaching (106-114).⁹ Under the first of these, he noted the terms Calvin employs to refer to accommodation (*accommodare* and

- ⁵ Dowey, *The Knowledge of God*, 3.
- ⁶ Dowey, The Knowledge of God. 3.
- ⁷ Dowey, The Knowledge of God, 4.

first extended discussion. Whether he should be credited with the discovery of accommodation in Calvin is perhaps open to question. Both Ford Lewis Battles and Richard Stauffer in 1977 and 1978 respectively seem to claim this honor for themselves. Both Battles' and Stauffer's studies will be discussed later in this chapter. The truth is that the tribute could go to several authors. See Paul Lobstein, 'La Connaissance religieuse d'après Calvin. Étude d'Histoire et de Dogmatique,' *Revue de Théologie et de Philosophie* 42 (1909), 53-110 (we have been unable to see a copy of Lobstein's essay and mention it on the basis of it's appearance in Dowey); Rev. A. Mitchell Hunter, *The Teaching of Calvin; A Modern Interpretation* (Glascow: Maclehose, Jackson and Co., 1920), 48, no. 2; and Arnold Williams, *The Common Expositor; An Account of the Commentaries on Genesis, 1527-1633* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1948), 176-177—nonetheless, Dowey's, as was said, is the first extended discussion of the motif.

⁴ See Richard Muller 'Directions in Current Calvin Research,' in *Calvin Studies IX: Papers Presented at the ninth Colloquium on Calvin Studies, January 30-31, 1998*, ed. John Leith and Robert Johnson (Davidson, NC: Calvin Studies Society, 1998), 84.

⁸ Reinhold Hedtke, *Erziehung durch die Kirche bei Calvin* (Heidelberg: Quelle & Meyer, 1969). Thanks are due to Dr Josef Boehle for help with the German.

⁹ Hedtke, *Erziehung durch die Kirche bei Calvin*, 33-39, 106-114 (the endnotes for these sections appear on 170-74 and 203-206 respectively).

INTRODUCTION

attemperare) and to human capacity (ad captum, ad modulum nostrum, infirmitas, ruditas, imbecillitas and tenuitas). He also discussed the ideas, such as anthropomorphism, the will of God, sacraments, and the Incarnation, with which Calvin associates God's accommodating. Following this, he, in a manner similar to what one finds in Dowey, Battles and others, commented on the important place accommodation holds in the reformer's theology, declaring that the accommodation of God and the weakness and capacity of the people is the expression (Ausdruck) and centre (Zentrum) of God's acting in salvation.¹⁰ This lead Hedtke to make several remarks on the consequences of this idea and on the nature of this divine pedagogy, including the nice observation that God is the supreme and only doctor (summus et unicus doctor) of the church (a quotation he drew from Calvin's lectures on Micah).11 This was followed by discussion of the corresponding notions of the schola Dei, discipuli Dei, schola Christi and the like as he finished off the section. Under the section on preaching, Hedtke developed ideas on the relationship between the accommodation of God's prophets, his apostles and the doctors and pastors of the church.¹² He also commented on the character and intention of accommodation in preaching. What is especially impressive in this study is Hedtke's engagement with Calvin's corpus, which is extremely full, especially given that his treatment of the motif is short. He cites from a range of Calvin's works-commentaries, sermons, selected treatises and the Institutes-with roughly 250 citations appearing in the endnotes.¹³ Not all of these deal specifically with accommodation, and the Institutes features more prominently than any other work, but the effort is still an impressive one

A second perspective on Calvin and accommodation emerged nearly twenty years after Dowey's work but only a year after Hedtke's in an important paper read by E. David Willis at the American Academy of Religion conference in 1970 and published four years later. This new interpretation conceived of accommodation as associated with divine revelation, as Dowey had, but took a different approach towards the motif. Broadly aligned with the growing interest in the reformer's humanist background inspired by scholars like Quirinus Breen,¹⁴ Willis interpreted Calvin's thinking on accommodation as one of several '[i]nstances of Calvin's Rhetorical Theology.'¹⁵ This rhetorical theology, Willis argued, reflected themes

¹⁰ Hedtke, *Erziehung durch die Kirche bei Calvin*, 36.

¹¹ Hedtke, *Erziehung durch die Kirche bei Calvin*, 36, the quote is found on 173.

¹² Hedtke, Erziehung durch die Kirche bei Calvin, 106-114.

¹³ He cites from random treatises as well as Calvin's expositions of Genesis, Exodus, Numbers, Deuteronomy, 1 Samuel, Psalms, Isaiah, Jeremiah, Ezekiel, Daniel, and a number of the minor prophets, three of the four gospels (Matthew, Mark and John), Romans, 1 and 2 Corinthians, Ephesians, 2 Timothy, Titus, Hebrews, 1 Peter and 1 John. Although, as we say, the *Institutes* dominates, yet the sermons on Deuteronomy also features prominently.

¹⁴ Quirinus Breen, John Calvin: A Study in French Humanism (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1931); idem, Christianity and Humanism (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1968).

¹⁵ E. David Willis, 'Rhetoric and Responsibility in Calvin's Theology,' in *The Context of Contemporary Theology: Essays in Honor of Paul Lehmann*, eds. A. J. McKelway and E. David Willis (Atlanta: John Knox Press, 1974), 53 (the essay runs from page 43 to page 63). Prior to Willis, see Charles Trinkaus, 'Renaissance Problems in Calvin's Theology,' *Studies in the Renaissance* 1 (1954), 66-67, and Ford