

STUDIES IN GERMAN IDEALISM

## HEGEL'S IDEA OF THE GOOD LIFE

From Virtue to Freedom, Early Writings  
and Mature Political Philosophy

by Andrew B. Giddens

In *Hegel's Idea of the Good Life*, Andrew B. Giddens traces the way his subject thinks about the relationship and tension of virtue and freedom.

This inquiry is the most ambitious of recent work on Hegel, a project which seeks to be comprehensive in its attention to the whole of his work. Hegel's earliest thought on virtue encompasses his early essays on virtue in *Phänomen des Geistes* (1807) and *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807), his early political work in *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807) and *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807), his mature political philosophy in *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807) and *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807), and his mature political philosophy in *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807) and *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807). This inquiry is the most ambitious of recent work on Hegel, a project which seeks to be comprehensive in its attention to the whole of his work. Hegel's earliest thought on virtue encompasses his early essays on virtue in *Phänomen des Geistes* (1807) and *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807), his early political work in *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807) and *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807), his mature political philosophy in *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807) and *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807), and his mature political philosophy in *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807) and *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807).

Hegel's idea of the good life provides a comprehensive account of the relationship and tension of virtue and freedom. This inquiry is the most ambitious of recent work on Hegel, a project which seeks to be comprehensive in its attention to the whole of his work. Hegel's earliest thought on virtue encompasses his early essays on virtue in *Phänomen des Geistes* (1807) and *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807), his early political work in *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807) and *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807), his mature political philosophy in *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807) and *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807), and his mature political philosophy in *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807) and *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807).

Hegel's idea of the good life provides a comprehensive account of the relationship and tension of virtue and freedom. This inquiry is the most ambitious of recent work on Hegel, a project which seeks to be comprehensive in its attention to the whole of his work. Hegel's earliest thought on virtue encompasses his early essays on virtue in *Phänomen des Geistes* (1807) and *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807), his early political work in *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807) and *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807), his mature political philosophy in *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807) and *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807), and his mature political philosophy in *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807) and *Phänomen der Geistesgeschichte* (1807).

1 www.springer.com

978-1-107-01111-1



HEGEL'S IDEA OF THE GOOD LIFE

Andrew B. Giddens



STUDIES IN GERMAN IDEALISM

## HEGEL'S IDEA OF THE GOOD LIFE

From Virtue to Freedom, Early Writings  
and Mature Political Philosophy

by Andrew B. Giddens



Springer

STUDIES IN GERMAN IDEALISM

# HEGEL'S IDEA OF THE GOOD LIFE

From Virtue to Freedom, Early Writings  
and Mature Political Philosophy

by Joshua D. Goldstein

## HEGEL'S IDEA OF THE GOOD LIFE

# Studies in German Idealism

*Series Editor:*

Reinier Munk, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam, The Netherlands*

*Advisory Editorial Board:*

Frederick Beiser, *Syracuse University, U.S.A.*  
George di Giovanni, *McGill University, Montreal, Canada*  
Helmut Holzhey, *University of Zürich, Switzerland*  
Detlev Pätzold, *University of Groningen, The Netherlands*  
Robert Solomon, *University of Texas at Austin, Texas, U.S.A.*

VOLUME 7

# HEGEL'S IDEA OF THE GOOD LIFE

From Virtue to Freedom, Early Writings  
and Mature Political Philosophy

by

JOSHUA D. GOLDSTEIN

*McGill University and University of Toronto,  
Canada*

 Springer

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

ISBN-10 1-4020-4191-8 (HB)  
ISBN-13 978-1-4020-4191-4 (HB)  
ISBN-10 1-4020-4192-6 (e-book)  
ISBN-13 978-1-4020-4192-1 (e-book)

---

Published by Springer,  
P.O. Box 17, 3300 AA Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

*www.springeronline.com*

*Printed on acid-free paper*

All Rights Reserved  
© 2006 Springer

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

Printed in the Netherlands.

*To Maureen,  
Hannah,  
and Abby*

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	XI
ABBREVIATIONS, WORKS, AND TRANSLATIONS	XIII
INTRODUCTION	XVII
PART I: THE DEVELOPMENT AND DECLINE OF AN ARISTOTELIAN IDEA OF THE GOOD LIFE, 1793 TO 1800	
1 THE HUMAN SPIRIT AND FOLK-RELIGION: THE TÜBINGEN ESSAY OF 1793	3
I. A Purpose Apart from Religion	3
A. The Basic Categories of Religious Analysis	4
B. Subjective and Objective Religion	11
C. The Place of Folk-religion	15
II. The Human Spirit	18
A. "A Natural Need of the Human Spirit"	18
B. The Foundations of the Human Spirit	21
C. The Unity of the Human Spirit	28
III. The Folk-Religion Project	31
A. Religion and Natural Need	31
B. Folk-Religion and Natural Need	34
C. The Instability of the Folk-Religion Project	41
2 DISCOVERING THE COMMUNITY: THE BERNE FRAGMENTS OF 1794	49
I. A Return to the Social World	49
A. From Socrates and Christ to Athens and Jerusalem	50
B. The Elements of a Theory of Historical Development	55
1. The Phenomenology of Change: Elements I and II	56
2. The Mechanism of Historical Development: Element III	57
3. Elaboration and Further Complications: Elements IV and V	58



4.	The Nature of Degeneration: Element VI	59
5.	The Mediation of the Estates: Element VII	60
C.	A Theory of Historical Development	61
II.	Community and the Human Spirit	64
A.	Historical Development and the Concept of the Community	64
B.	A Social Critique of Christianity	67
C.	Alienation and Community	72
III.	Participation and Satisfaction	78
A.	External Tension and Hope: the Possibility of Overlapping Communities	78
B.	Reason and Participation	80
3	THE END OF THE HUMAN SPIRIT: THE <i>LIFE OF JESUS</i> OF 1795	85
I.	The <i>Volkserzieher's</i> Project	85
A.	Kantian Appearances	86
B.	A Successful <i>Volkserzieher</i> ?	88
C.	A Negative Conformity with the <i>Volkserzieher's</i> Task	93
II.	The <i>Volkserzieher's</i> Solution to the Problem of Participation	95
A.	An Audience of Believers in Reason	95
B.	Reason: Rulership, Obedience, and Self-Legislation	96
C.	Self-Legislation as a Model of the Human Spirit	103
III.	The Collapse of Self-Legislation and the Human Spirit	104
A.	Rulership and Self-Assertion: the Collapse of <i>Phronêsis</i>	104
B.	Obedience: the Collapse of Absolute <i>Selbsttätigkeit</i>	108
C.	A Transition to a New Basis of the Good Life	111
PART II: FREEDOM AND THE COMPLETION OF ARISTOTELIAN VIRTUE, 1821		
4	THE MATURE FOUNDATION OF THE GOOD LIFE: SPIRIT AND FREEDOM	121
I.	From the Human to the Spiritual Foundations of the Good Life	121
A.	A Miseducation to the Nature of the Free Will	123
B.	The Free Will's Nature and the Human Spirit's Inadequacy	127
II.	The Human Spirit's New Experience and Activity within the Good Life	135
III.	The Condition of Freedom and the New Question of the Good Life	139
A.	Freedom and the Ancient Vision of the Good	140
B.	Freedom and the Modern Vision of the Good	142
C.	The New Question of the Good Life: Inquiring into the Living Presence of the Good	144

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ix

5	THE LIVING FORM OF THE GOOD LIFE	147
	I. The Institutional Form of the Good Life	147
	A. Locating the Institutional Home of the Good	147
	B. Ethical Institutions as Ethical Powers	154
	C. The Ethical Powers	157
	1. Internal Stability	158
	2. Mutual Exclusivity	170
	3. A Sphere of Life	172
	II. The Experiential Form of the Good Life	175
	A. Duty	176
	B. Virtue and Rectitude	178
	C. Custom and Habit	181
	III. The Living Instances of the Good Life	183
	A. The Inadequacy of Philosophy as the Good Life	184
	B. The Customary Good Life: Patriotism	187
	C. The Ethical Habits of the Good Life	189
6	THE IDEA OF THE GOOD LIFE	197
	I. The Shape of the Good Life	197
	A. The Truth within the Description of Ethical Life	197
	B. The Criticism within the Description of Ethical Life	201
	C. The New Solution within the Description of Ethical Life	206
	II. Enchantment and Banality	213
	III. Vitality and the New Virtue of Freedom	218
	A. Completing Ancient Ethical Virtue in Rectitude	220
	B. Completing Ancient <i>Phronêsis</i> in Ethical Habit	222
	C. The Collective Determination in the New <i>Phronêsis</i> and the Playful Revolution	226
	WORKS CITED	239
	INDEX	247

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book was a long time in coming; the debts that it has accumulated are now many.

Begun as a doctoral dissertation in the Department of Political Science at the University of Toronto, the book benefitted immensely from my time there. Alan Brudner, my former thesis supervisor, brought to the project deep insights into the Hegelian texts, a fine sense for those places where my arguments ran solid against the boundaries of good interpretation, and a law professor's eye for clarity. Ronnie Beiner's interest in *phronêsis* and the ways in which the Greeks can speak to modernity contributed to my own thinking about the place of virtue in Hegel's thought. Ed Andrew was finally able to win me over to the virtues of the short, declarative sentence—although I fear it remains more of a regulative ideal than a living relation to my writing. More substantively, Ed's keen historical sense made me more attentive to this historical context in which ideas are expressed, even if the dominant reflex of this book is to turn to the structure of the text itself. Gad Horowitz's relentless interpretative drive to take the idea of social-individuality seriously provided the formative opportunity to reflect on the meaning and implications of what Hegel calls "the I that is a We and the We that is an I". The conclusions I draw in this book show a different understanding of the sociality of human freedom, but the project would not have taken the course that it did without his influence.

The seemingly endless task of revising the manuscript was made lighter by the work and friendship of number of emerging scholars from The Hebrew University of Jerusalem: Oded Löwenheim, Tal Dingott Alkopher, and, in particular, Oren Soffer and Nahshon Perez whose love of political theory stimulated innumerable long and challenging conversations over various aspects of the ideas presented here. Roddy Loepky, although not from The Hebrew University, provided friendship and encouragement as we each moved forward with our book projects. What little I know of the political economy of human genomics, I owe to him.

The book's final revisions received stimulation, perhaps of a less direct but no less valuable variety, from the 2004/5 Montréal Political Theory Workshop speakers and participants. While he was at McGill, I was par-

ticularly grateful for the opportunity to work with Alan Patten. His comments and suggestions helped solidify and shape work that emerged from this larger project.

Devin Crawley deployed his long experience and sharp editorial pencil to make the manuscript that much more clear and presentable. It was a pleasure to have such an old friend work on the book.

I would like to thank the Social Science and Humanities Research Council of Canada for providing funding at the doctoral and post-doctoral level that made both the initial research and the revisions of the manuscript possible. The Munk Centre for International Studies at the University of Toronto has served as the home where much of the thinking and writing occurred; the Department of Political Science at McGill was my home away from home.

Over the years, a number of the arguments in this book have been presented at annual meetings of the Canadian Political Science Association, a graduate student colloquium at the University of Toronto, and at the Montreal Political Theory Workshop. Versions of some of the material present here also appear in two articles, "The 'Bees Problem' in Hegel's Political Philosophy: Habit, Phronêsis and Experience of the Good' in *History of Political Thought*, vol. 25 no. 3 (Autumn) 2004, pp. 1–27 and "Hegel's Early Conception of Human Nature in the Tübingen Essay of 1793" in *Clio: A Journal of Literature, History, and the Philosophy of History*, vol. 32 no. 4 (Summer) 2003, pp. 433–456.

Of course, my preeminent debt is to my wife, Maureen Hiebert, who listened to my endless ruminations about Hegel supportively and with good humour while finishing her own incomparably more important project. My gratitude cannot be adequately expressed here. This book is also dedicated my daughters, Hannah and Abby, each of whom came along well before the manuscript was complete and more than anyone put it in its proper place.

ABBREVIATIONS, WORKS,  
AND TRANSLATIONS

References to works by G.W.F. Hegel follow the abbreviations listed below. All citations are to the indicated translations except those marked “trans.” which are my own. Unless otherwise indicated, all emphasis in quoted material is in the original. Material inserted by the translators is indicated by angled brackets ( <...> ); my own modifications to the material are indicated by square brackets ( [...] ). See “Cited by” for information on how the material is cited.

- BF* “Berne Fragments”
- German: “*Volksreligion und Christentum*” pp. 30–72 in *Hegels theologische Jugendschriften* (ed. Herman Nohl) (Frankfurt/Main: Minerva GmbH, 1966).
- English: “Berne Fragments” pp. 59–103 in *Three Essays, 1793–1795: The Tübingen Essay, Berne Fragments, and The Life of Jesus* (eds. and trans. Peter Fuss and John Dobbs) (University of Notre Dame Press, 1984).
- Except: “The Berne Plan of 1794” pp. 508–510 in *Hegel’s Development: Towards the Sunlight (1770–1801)* (trans. H.S. Harris) (Oxford: Oxford Clarendon Press, 1972).
- Cited by: Page number to the Nohl edition (Nohl pagination is included in the English editions).
- 
- EG* *The Encyclopaedia of Mind*
- German: *Enzyklopädie der philosophischen Wissenschaften im Grundrisse: 1830 — Dritter Teil die Philosophie des Geistes mit den mündlichen Zusätzen. Werke in zwanzig Bänden: Werke 10* (eds. Eva Moldenhauer and Karl Markus Michel) (Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, 1986).
- English: *Hegel’s Philosophy of Mind: Being Part Three of the Encyclopaedia of the Philosophical Sciences (1830)* (trans. William Wallace) “Together with the *Zusätze* in Boumann’s Text (1845)” (trans. A.V. Miller) (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1971).
- Cited by: Section number.

- EL*
- The Encyclopaedia of Logic*
- German: *Enzyklopädie der philosophischen Wissenschaften im Grundrisse: 1830 — Erster Teil die Wissenschaft der Logik mit den mündlichen Zusätzen. Werke in zwanzig Bänden: Werke 8* (eds. Eva Moldenhauer and Karl Markus Michel) (Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, 1970).
- English: *The Encyclopaedia Logic, with the Zusätze: Part I of the Encyclopaedia of Philosophical Sciences with the Zusätze* (trans. T.F. Geraets, W.A. Suchting, and H.S. Harris) (Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, Inc., 1991).
- Cited by: Section number.
- LJ*
- Life of Jesus*
- German: “*Das Leben Jesu*” pp. 75–136 in *Hegels theologische Jugendschriften* (ed. Herman Nohl) (Frankfurt/Main: Minerva GmbH, 1966 [1907]).
- English: “The Life of Jesus” pp. 104–165 in *Three Essays, 1793–1795: The Tübingen Essay, Berne Fragments, and The Life of Jesus* (eds. and trans. Peter Fuss and John Dobbs) (Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press, 1984).
- Cited by: Page number to the Nohl edition (Nohl pagination is included in the English editions).
- NdA*
- “*Neufassung des Anfangs*” (“New Version of the Beginning”)
- German: “*Die Ueberarbeitung von 1800*” pp. 139–151 in *Hegels theologische Jugendschriften* (ed. Herman Nohl) (Frankfurt/Main: Minerva GmbH, 1966 [1907]).
- English: *The Positivity of the Christian Religion*, “Part III. Revised Form of Sections 1–4 of Part I” pp. 167–181 in *Early Theological Writings* (trans. T.M. Knox) (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1971).
- Cited by: Page number to the German followed by the English.
- NR*
- Natural Law*
- German: *Über die wissenschaftlichen Behandlungsarten des Naturrechts, seine Stelle in der praktischen Philosophie und sein Verhältnis zu den positiven Rechtswissenschaften* pp. 434–530 in *G.W.F. Hegel Jenaer Schriften 1801–1807. Werke in zwanzig Bänden: Werke 10* (eds. Eva Moldenhauer and Karl Markus Michel) (Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, 1986).

- English: *Natural Law: The Scientific Ways of Treating Natural Law, its Place in Moral Philosophy, and its Relation to the Positive Sciences of Law* (trans. T.M. Knox) (USA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1982).
- Cited by: Page number to the German followed by the English.
- PhG* *The Phenomenology of Spirit*
- German: *Phänomenologie des Geistes. Werke in zwanzig Bänden: Werke 3* (eds. Eva Moldenhauer and Karl Markus Michel) (Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, 1986).
- English: *Hegel's Phenomenology of Spirit* (trans. A.V. Miller) (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1977).
- Cited by: Page number to the German followed by paragraph number to the English.
- PR* *The Philosophy of Right*
- German: *Grundlinien der Philosophie des Rechts oder Naturrecht und Staatswissenschaft im Grundrisse: Mit Hegels eigenhändigen Notizen und den mündlichen Zusätzen. Werke in zwanzig Bänden: Werke 7* (eds. Eva Moldenhauer and Karl Markus Michel) (Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, 1986).
- English: *Elements of the Philosophy of Right* (ed. Allen W. Wood; trans. H.B. Nisbet) (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991).
- Cited by: Section number, sometimes followed by a "Z" indicating material contained in his *Zusatz* (additions) or an "A" indicating material contained in his *Anmerkung* (remarks). For example: (*PR* §§ 150 & A, Z, 153A, 154) refers to sections 150 and its *Anmerkung* and its *Zusatz*; only the *Anmerkung* to section 153; and only section 154.
- TE* "Tübingen Essay"
- German: "Volksreligion und Christentum" pp. 1–29 in *Hegels theologische Jugendschriften* (ed. Herman Nohl) (Frankfurt/Main: Minerva GmbH, 1966).
- English: "The Tübingen Essay of 1793" pp. 481–507 in *Hegel's Development: Towards the Sunlight (1770-1801)* (trans. H.S. Harris) (Oxford: Oxford Clarendon Press, 1972).
- Cited by: Page number to the Nohl edition (Nohl pagination is included in the English editions).